

Report

On the Multi-Stakeholder Workshop in Paraguay

Project: Rural Electrification

Date: January 2006



**MINISTERIO DE OBRAS PÚBLICAS
Y COMUNICACIONES**

VICEMINISTERIO DE MINAS Y ENERGÍA



**Canadian International
Development Agency**

olade
Organización Latinoamericana de Energía



**UNIVERSITY OF
CALGARY**

The author of this document is consultant engineer, Mr. Jean-Claude Pulfer.

The opinions stated herein are the responsibility of the author and not of the sponsoring organizations: "Latin American Energy Organization" (OLADE), "Canadian International Development Agency" (CIDA), "University of Calgary" and the "Ministry of Public Works and Communications (MOPC) – Vice Ministry of Mining and Energy of Paraguay".

The information presented herein may be used if the source is cited.

Intellectual property rights belong to the Rural Electrification Project by OLADE/University of Calgary/CIDA/Vice Ministry of Mining and Energy of the MOPC of Paraguay.

1. Introduction

This report is part of the preparatory process for the Sustainable Rural Energy Project in Paraguay led by the Latin American Energy Organization (OLADE) with support from the University of Calgary, Canada and the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) and working with the national counterpart of the Vice Ministry of Mining and Energy (VMME). The project has been conducted in four countries of Latin America – Guatemala, Haiti, Bolivia and Paraguay – and mainly targets indigenous population groups, with special emphasis on women.

The report aims to present the core information regarding the Multi-Stakeholder Workshop (TMA), held in the city of Asunción (19-20 December 2005, Gran Hotel of Paraguay) and attended by OLADE's project coordinator, Byron Chiliquinga, and Leo Bouckhout on behalf of the University of Calgary. The venue of Paraguay's capital city rather than a locality in the project's target region was chosen for technical and practical reasons.

Most guests represented official national government entities headquartered in Asunción and the departmental government of Presidente Hayes, based in the city of Villa Hayes just 36 km from Asunción. Most civil-society organizations (CSOs) attending on behalf of actions in the target region have their head offices in the capital city. Therefore, only a minority of guests had to travel to the venue, which entailed a substantial saving for the project. Moreover, the target zone has little suitable infrastructure for such an event.

The TMA date was set to fall before year-end holidays and summer vacation in Paraguay, according to available time for Byron Chiliquinga and Leo Bouckhout, and additionally when the report on "Analysis and Selection of Communities in Paraguay" had been completed by the local consultant, at least in draft form.

The Workshop's main goals were:

1. For guest stakeholders to learn about the project;
2. To involve stakeholders in the project implementation process;
3. To gather essential information to facilitate successful project implementation;
4. To choose the target community for project implementation;
5. To set up a multi-party commission to backstop project implementation.

2. Preparatory Activities

Participant selection

Participants were selected by consensus between the local consulting team and the national project coordinator, Gustavo Cazal of VMME, who in early November 2005 replaced Daniel Puentes in that position. A balance was struck between governmental and private stakeholders, also including representatives of the project's target population. To hold participants to 25 plus the local consultant team, representatives of

VMME, logistical support staff and guests of OLADE and the University of Calgary, the list was prepared with 28 guests (14 governmental and 14 non-governmental) foreseeing that some might be unable to attend.

Since the project began, VMME had involved various national government agencies related directly to the project's main thrusts, with an eye to facilitating the local consultant's information-gathering to prepare assessment reports and select communities, and to endorse decisions on the direction to take in the community selection process. These agencies were the National Electricity Administration (ANDE), the Statistics, Surveys and Census Agency (DGEEC), the National Institute of Rural Development and Land (INDERT), the National Institute of Technology and Standards (INTN), the Paraguayan Indigenous Institute (INDI), the Secretariat of Social Action (SAS), the Women's Secretariat (SM) and the Technical Secretariat of Planning (STP). For this purpose, the ad hoc commission has met several times in the VMME from July through December 2005 with the national coordinator and the local consultant.

In addition to all the above governmental entities, representatives of the departmental government of Presidente Hayes (where the target district, Puerto Pinasco, is located) and of the municipal government of that district, two of the country's most important universities, and a number of CSOs from the indigenous, social, environmental, educational and business sectors were also invited to the TMA (see participant list, Attachment 1). The Celestina Pérez de Almada Foundation and the INTN are already experienced in rural energy projects. The Rural Association of Paraguay (ARP) is the main organization for the country's cattle ranchers. Since cattle raising is the predominant economic activity in the target zone, it was considered important to invite a representative of the Alto Chaco region cattlemen. The Esenberg consulting firm has done consulting work for VMME, including rural energy issues.

The DesdelChaco Foundation and Sobreviviencia are environmental organizations that are active in the Chaco region, including indigenous communities in their actions. Tierra Viva and GAT are organizations mainly working to secure land tenure for indigenous people. CONAMURI is a group of grassroots organizations of rural women from all over the country. CONAPI, CIPAE and PCI are organizations taking social action in favor of the indigenous people.

The list also included the main radio station for the Bajo Chaco zone, Radio Paí Pukú. Representing the indigenous ethnic group to benefit from the project, the delegate of the Angaité people from the Departmental Indigenous Council of the Governor's Office of Presidente Hayes was invited.

Logistics

The team preparing for the event comprised the local consultant, supported by two advisors (gender and communication), the national project coordinator, supported by several other VMME officials. Once the decision was made to hold the event in Asunción, the preparatory team made a short list of three hotels specializing in seminars that had sufficient capacity during the days scheduled for the event: the Gran Hotel of Paraguay, the Hotel Villa Morra Suite and the Hotel Excelsior. They were asked to quote for the event itself and for lodging participants from outside town and feeding all participants during the event. After evaluating the three bids, and with OLADE's concurrence, the Gran Hotel of Paraguay was chosen because of easy access, comfortable facilities and good service at a reasonable cost.

Preliminary agenda

The local consultant team prepared a preliminary agenda on the basis of the TMA held in Guatemala. However, it was preferred to shorten it from two days to one day and a half, to make it easier for people to attend who direct government and private institutions, because prior to Christmas holidays they are generally overloaded with many activities involving the imminent closing out of the year. This might otherwise prevent them from taking part in the TMA. The consultant team felt that they might be encouraged to attend a shorter event, without leaving out too much subject matter.

The draft preliminary agenda was submitted for consideration by the national project coordinator, who also discussed it with the relevant authorities of the VMME before approving it without any significant changes. Given the importance of the event, they felt it would be relevant for the Minister of Public Works and Communications (which the VMME works under) to open it officially. Finally, the agenda was submitted for consideration by the project coordination team, comprising representatives of OLADE and the University of Calgary, who made valuable suggestions to enhance the program and attain expected outcomes more efficiently.

The event was arranged by alternating different types of activities: lectures by experts were followed by plenary discussions of topics related to the preceding presentation. Another format was group work, dividing the plenary into different topics. Groups then presented their conclusions for plenary discussion. To actively involve all group members, they were given colored cards and marking pens to summarize their personal ideas regarding each issue, which were then placed on an orderly screen for all group members to appreciate. This is an excellent working methodology to discuss complex issues in a relatively short time, with summarized, readily combined outputs.

Invitations

Invitations to participate in the Multi-Stakeholder Workshop were officially made by the Vice Ministry of Mining and Energy, signed by the Vice Minister himself, Mr. Héctor Ruíz-Díaz (see Attachment 2). They included an attached executive summary of the Sustainable Rural Energy Project and the preliminary agenda. Invitations were mostly sent by email and/or fax or, for those agencies located in Asunción, hand-delivered by VMME staff.

3. Implementation

Infrastructure and opening

The event was scheduled to start at 3 p.m. on 19 December 2005, to enable participants from faraway locations in the Chaco to arrive in time, by leaving very early that morning. These people were provided with a hotel room and lunch on arrival. For obvious reasons, participants from Asunción and Villa Hayes were not lodged.

For the TMA's activities, a large, very comfortable room was arranged with the tables in a U-shaped configuration to seat about 30. At the front of the room, there was a whiteboard and a screen to project multimedia presentations using a projector connected to a laptop computer. A sound system included several microphones, to ensure good acoustics so all participants could understand clearly, and to record the whole event.

In the event that translation from Spanish into Guaraní were required, a specialist in communication (part of the local consultant team) was on hand. Guaraní is the language most spoken in Paraguay, even among non-Guaraní ethnic groups.

The Minister of Public Works and Communications, originally scheduled to open the event, was prevented from attending by another commitment, as was the Vice Minister of Mines and Energy, so the official opening was not included. The national project coordinator, Mr. Gustavo Casal, opened the workshop at 3:30, briefly welcoming participants.

Participants

Out of the 28 institutions invited only 11 attended, plus another two institutions not on the original list, but who were informed of the event by Tierra Viva (see list of participants, Attachment 3): The Sustainable Development Foundation of Paraguay (FUNDESUP) and the Coordinating Agency of Indigenous Leaders of Bajo Chaco (CLIBCH). Many non-governmental institutions did not attend, the exceptions being the DesdelChaco Foundation, GAT, the Celestina Pérez de Almada Foundation and the National University of Asunción.

Government representatives included ANDE, INDERT, INTN, STP, SM (2) and the Governor's Office of Presidente Hayes (2) representing the Indigenous Affairs Secretariat and the Secretariat of Social Action. The representatives of the Angaités and from the Municipality of Puerto Pinasco were unable to reach Asunción because recent rainfall had made roadways in their zone unusable. No communications were received from the other institutions to explain their absence. One of the main reasons for the relatively low participation by CSOs probably has to do with the date of the event. Year end is always very busy with activities to close out the year for them.

Continuing with the agenda

Aside from the opening, the first day went just as scheduled on the preliminary agenda (see Attachment 4). It began with a presentation on national government policies and actions in the area of rural energy by Mr. Gustavo Cazal as Departmental Head of Conventional Energies under the Directorate of Energy Resources of VMME. He placed special emphasis on the Energy Sector Strategic Plan that will guide the national government's energy policy for the next few years.

As the second presentation, Mr. Byron Chilibingua presented a brief institutional introduction on OLADE and then explained the Sustainable Rural Energy Project, which is part of OLADE's Rural Electrification Program. He also mentioned experiences to date in Guatemala, where the project has a head start on Paraguay's project.



Photograph 1, right to left: Byron Chilibingua, Leo Bouckhout, Gustavo Cazal

After the break, all participants introduced themselves, the institutions they represent, their field of activity and expectations for the Workshop.

The day closed out with the report ("Assessment of the Energy Sector in Paraguay") by local consultant Jean-Claude Pulfer and the following discussion, which mostly focused on the problem and causes of deforestation in Paraguay.



Photograph 2, left to right: Leonardo González and Silvero Centurión, leaders of the Coordinating Agency of Indigenous Leaders of Bajo Chaco (CLIBCH)

The second day started with a recap of the first day's work by Gustavo Cazal and explanation of changes in the agenda by Jean-Claude Pulfer. The methodology for group work, to include societal criteria in rural energy projects, was explained later. Before that activity, Byron Chiliquinga presented the basic concepts in this area, as a basis for group discussions.



Photograph 3: Valentín Bobadilla presenting his group's conclusions

The plenary was divided into two groups of equal size, and each chose a group chairperson, secretary and rapporteur. Each group had to discuss two issues, identified by the local consultant team beforehand. Group 1 discussed ethnic-cultural and educational issues and Group 2 discussed economic and organizational issues. Both groups had to mainstream gender issues throughout both topics. For each issue, they first analyzed the current situation and problems, and then proposed possible solutions. After group discussions, each rapporteur presented their conclusions to the plenary.

Both the problems identified and their potential solutions are presented on charts in Attachment 5.

As a last activity for the morning of Day 2, Jean-Claude Pulfer presented his report, "Analysis and Selection of Communities in Paraguay".

After lunch, the report was discussed, and the plenary expressed its support for the methodology used and the proposed project beneficiary community selected, namely the indigenous community of La Patria located in the District of Puerto Pinasco. According to Juan Fleitas of the Secretariat of Indigenous Affairs of the Governor's Office of Presidente Hayes, this is a well-organized community with promising production potential. Since La Patria has almost 250 families spread throughout 14 villages, the seed capital cannot benefit the entire population from the beginning. Byron Chiliquinga then proposed selecting a single village in the community, to play the role as center of the community, and then replicate projects in the other villages, as far as the seed capital will go.

Next, a sustainable development proposal for indigenous communities in the Bajo Chaco was presented by Dr. Modesto Elizeche, as legal advisor of CLIBCH, the organization of indigenous leaders from various ethnic groups in Bajo Chaco.



Photograph 4: audience during a presentation

The event's last task was to choose a steering commission for the Multi-Stakeholder Workshop. For this purpose, Jean-Claude Pulfer first presented his proposal regarding its functions and membership, as a basis for plenary discussion. He proposed including government stakeholders such as the Ministries of Education and Culture (MEC) and Public Health and Social Welfare (MSPBS), and the Environmental Secretariat (SEAM). Gilda Peralta, the local consultant's gender advisor, expressed her interest in including GETA, the NGO of which she is the director, in the Multi-Stakeholder Workshop, in view of their experience working with production projects in indigenous communities of Bajo Chaco. It was also agreed to re-invite institutions that missed the event.



Photograph 5: Election of the steering commission

After discussion and decision about the number of members for the steering commission and its officers, it was elected. The following persons were elected by the plenary:

- Coordinator: Juan Fleitas - Secretariat of Indigenous Affairs, Govt. of P. Hayes
Deputy Coordinator: Maria Emilia de Castell - INTN
Secretary: Valentín Bobadilla – National University of Asunción
Facilitator: Luís Centurión - ANDE
Member 1: Martín Almada – Celestina Pérez de Almada Foundation
Member 2: Bibi Yurrita – DESDELCHACO FOUNDATION.

These people will be ratified officially by the institutions they represent, as requested by VMME in writing.

After a round of evaluation involving all those present, practically everyone expressed satisfaction with the results of the TMA and their commitment to continue participating in the project implementation project. Finally, the event was closed in a timely fashion by Gustavo Casal of VMME.

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1: Participant List

Institution Name:	Area of Activity:	Headquarters:
National Government:		
ANDE	Electricity generation and distribution	Asunción
INDI	Indigenous people	Asunción
INDERT	Agrarian Reform	Asunción
DGEEC	Statistics	Asunción
INTN	Research, standards	Asunción
Secretariat of Social Action	Social Action	Asunción
Women's Secretariat	Support for women	Asunción
Technical Secretariat of Planning	Government planning	Asunción
Governor's Office:		
Governor of P. Hayes	Departmental executive government	Villa Hayes
Secretariat of Indigenous Affairs	Support for indigenous people	Villa Hayes
Secretariat of Social Action	Social Action	Villa Hayes
Departmental Indigenous Council	Indigenous representation	Villa Hayes
Municipality:		
Intendency	Municipal executive government	Puerto Pinasco
Municipal Board	Municipal legislative government	Puerto Pinasco
Universities:		
National University of Asunción		San Lorenzo
Catholic University		Asunción
CSOs:		
Tierra Viva	Legal advisory assistance for indigenous people	Asunción
National Coordinating Agency for Rural and Indigenous Women (CONAMURI)	Group of women's organizations	Asunción
National Coordinating Agency of Indigenous Pastoral Activities (CONAPI)	Indigenous people	Asunción
Committee of Churches for Emergency Aid (CIPAE – CPI) Chaco	Support for indigenous people	Asunción
Sobrevivencia	Environment	Asunción
Celestina Pérez de Almada Foundation	Human rights, alternative education, solar energy	Asunción
Group to Support the Totobiegosode (GAT)	Secure land tenure for indigenous people	Neuland
DesdelChaco Foundation	Environment	Loma Plata
Pro Indigenous Communities (PCI)	Support for indigenous people	Filadelfia
Federations:		
Rural Association of Paraguay (ARP) Alto Chaco Section	Cattle ranching	Asunción
Consulting Companies:		
Esenerg	Energy consulting	Asunción
Media:		
Radio Pa'í Pukú	Multicultural radio station	Irala Fernández

Attachment 2: Invitation Letter and Attachments (without preliminary agenda)



**MINISTERIO DE OBRAS PÚBLICAS
Y COMUNICACIONES**
VICEMINISTERIO DE MINAS Y ENERGÍA

Asunción, December 2005

NTA SSME No ° /2005

Mr. Merardo Rodríguez, Acting Director of Planning and Projects.
Paraguayan Indigenous Institute – INDI.
By hand.

*We are writing in regard to the Rural Energy Project that the Vice Ministry of Mining and Energy of the MOPC, in coordination with the University of Calgary of Canada and the Latin American Energy Organization (OLADE), are pursuing in our country. Under this project, a **Regional Multi-Stakeholder Workshop** is being organized to discuss developments, prospects and integrated development of rural energy. It will emphasize discussion of working models to promote user participation in projects and especially the inclusion of social variables in priority-setting for rural energy projects.*

Considering your experience regarding these issues and that the project targets indigenous communities, we would like to most cordially invite you to attend this important workshop, to be held in the Gran Hotel of Paraguay on December 19 and 20, 2005.

Considering the importance of this event for rural energy development and because of the logistical arrangements required, the number of participants is limited. Therefore, we request you confirm your participation at your earliest convenience. For this purpose, please call Mr. Gustavo Casal, Telephone 670-924 or Mr. Jean-Claude Pulfer, Telephone 224-982 and 579-831

We reiterate our sincere regards and await your confirmation.

*Attachment: Agenda, Project Summary
cc: Chief of Cabinet*



SUSTAINABLE RURAL ENERGY PROJECT

INTRODUCTION

The Sustainable Rural Energy Project is directed by the Latin American Energy Organization (OLADE www.olade.org.ec) with support from the University of Calgary, Canada and the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) in four countries of Latin America, namely Guatemala, Haiti, Bolivia and Paraguay. In our country, the national counterpart is the Vice Ministry of Mining and Energy (VMME).

GOAL

To contribute to developing rural electrification in all OLADE member countries by supporting strategy design to attain greater coverage, disseminate technologies, exchange experiences and train the responsible staff.

SCOPE

To establish policy guidelines to improve rural electrification in poor, isolated rural zones, on the basis of practical results of implementing 12 pilot energy supply projects in selected communities of four Member Countries. Guidelines must emerge from the public up to decision-makers, so the project includes active involvement of societal stakeholders, including gender-related and indigenous organizations.

ACTIVITIES

1. Participation by Social Stakeholders

Methodological criteria are being developed to fully involve societal stakeholders throughout the management chain of an energy project, emphasizing gender and indigenous issues. For this purpose, each of the four project beneficiary projects will prepare methodological proposals to be presented, discussed and approved at Multi-stakeholder Workshops, an ad-hoc advisory group comprising the main stakeholders in the rural energy sector. This advisory group, on a regional or national level, will analyze and suggest procedures to incorporate the perspectives of gender-related and indigenous organizations, to mentor implementation of pilot projects and support evaluation of the outcomes achieved, from users' standpoint.

2. Assessment and community selection

Considering the project's aim of establishing policy guidelines, the current status of the rural energy sector in each project beneficiary country must be determined. An assessment of the rural sector's situation will reveal the socio-economic, institutional, and regulatory context, developing programs/projects, existing services and barriers, among other baseline features.

In each beneficiary country, a community will be selected to implement three pilot energy systems. The community will be selected under a series of criteria including the poverty level, service coverage, governmental planning, basic infrastructure, and promotion of production projects. Each selected community's needs and available resources will be assessed, directly involving the local public, seeking to prioritize their requirements in order to implement projects for integrated, self-sustaining development.

To define pilot projects to implement, a survey of successful projects in other countries will aim to select the most outstanding initiatives and replicate them in the 12 pilot projects. The projects must be complementary, since they will be implemented in a single community.

3. Pilot project design and implementation

Pilot projects to be implemented will be designed by the community and the Project Technical Team, considering energy as an instrument for development. Under that premise, projects may satisfy such basic needs as water supply, health, education and communication, using energy systems. They may also implement production units to generate income for the community.

One especially key element will be to set up mechanisms to make projects sustainable. A community enterprise will be implemented to administer, operate, finance and maintain the three pilot projects, so they can operate normally with their own resources. The project will provide seed capital to purchase equipment, handled as a revolving fund, in order to finance other projects in the beneficiary country.

Another project feature will be training for local community members and for the national counterpart in design, construction, operation, maintenance and administration of pilot project energy systems.

4. Evaluation of system impact

Impact and public acceptance studies will be made in the beneficiary communities, to ascertain their main opinions, problems, successes and recommendations regarding operation, service, cost, administration, changes in the people's standard of living, income generated, and such relevant data to assess the project's positive and negative impacts on the community. These documents will be presented and analyzed at national workshops involving the community, the national technical counterpart and the project coordinating team.

5. Gender Approach

Women are the foundation of rural households in energy supply and management, so they must be involved in any home or community energy initiative. Accordingly, an assertive study will be conducted to pose policy guidelines to adequately involve women in the energy sector of OLADE Member Countries. This document will be discussed at a Regional Gender Workshop to enrich the proposal.

6. The role of the indigenous peoples

To promote greater participation by minority social groups, a study will analyze and propose policy guidelines to involve the indigenous peoples in the energy sector of OLADE Member Countries. This document will be discussed at a Regional Workshop to enrich the proposal.

7. Policy guidelines

On the basis of results from pilot projects implemented in each country and the assessment document, strategies and policy guidelines will be proposed to seek to expand coverage of rural electrification, considering changes or creation of new mechanisms based on the analysis (which may be institutional, regulatory, financial, or others). This proposal will be analyzed in national workshops involving all stakeholders.

Once the national documents and proposed policy guidelines to incorporate gender and the indigenous peoples are available, a consolidated document pulling together all the proposals will be presented and discussed at a Regional Workshop attended by representatives of all OLADE Member Countries.

PROJECT PROGRESS IN PARAGUAY

To date, in the Paraguay project, local consultant Mr. Jean-Claude Pulfer has conducted the assessment of the rural energy situation in Paraguay (report available at: www.ssme.gov.py) and the analysis and selection of communities (report not published yet). This analysis chose as the project's target zone the District of Puerto Pinasco, Department of Presidente Hayes. In that District, three possible target communities were chosen: La Patria and Riacho San Carlos (both indigenous) and Colonia Ceibo (rural, non-indigenous).

GOALS OF THE MULTI-STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOP

The main goals of the Multi-Stakeholder Workshop are:

1. For stakeholders to learn about the project;
2. To involve stakeholders in the project implementation process.
3. To gather essential information to facilitate successful project implementation;
4. To set up a multi-party commission to backstop pilot project implementation;
5. To choose the target community for the pilot project.

Attachment 3: Participant List



**OLADE / U. Calgary / CIDA Program
Vice Ministry of Mining and Energy
Rural Energy Project
MULTI-STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOP
Asunción, 19 - 20 December 2005
PARTICIPANT LIST**

Full Name	Institution	Position	Email/Telephone
Martín Almada	Celestina Pérez de Almada Foundation	President	almada@rieder.net.py
María Eugenia Frers	STP	Technician	frers777@yahoo.com.ar
Leonardo González	CLIBCH	Secretary	leonargon@hotmail.com.
Juan R. Fleitas	Governor's Office of P. Hayes	Aide to the Indigenous Secretariat	026-262403 0991-526009
Nidia S. de Arce	Women's Secretariat	Coordinator, Western Zone	450-041
Verena de Regehr	GAT	Anthropologist	vregehr@telesurf.com.py
Bibi Yurrita	Desdelchaco	Consultant	eyurrita@desdelchaco.org.py
Francisca C. Ruiz Díaz	Women's Secretariat	Departmental Coordinating Office	melgarejo@mujer.com.py
Luís Centurión	ANDE	DED Section Head	laca_1@telesurf.com.py

Valentín Bobadilla	UNA School of Engineering	Area of Renewable Energy	valbob@cu.com.py valbob@gmx.net
Oswaldo R. Enciso	INDERT	Technician and Supervisor, Chaco	495-575 443-161
María E. Castell	INTN	Department Head	oea@intn.gov.py
Rosa Valdez	Governor's Office, P. Hayes	Secretariat of Social Action	026-262584 026-262403 0971-719347
Modesto Elizeche	FUNDESUP	Advisor	fundesupy@yahoo.es
Gilda Peralta	GETA	Director	gperalta@sce.cnc.una.py
Byron Chiliquinga-Mazón	OLADE	Coordinator of Renewable Sources and Environment	bchiliq@olade.org.ec
Leo W. Bouckhout	University of CALGARY	Environmental Consultant	lbouckhout@matrix-solutions.com
Gustavo Cazal	Vice Ministry of Mines and Energy	Department Head	gusad_cazal@yahoo.com
Andrés González	Vice Ministry of Mines and Energy	Technician	agonzalezalva@yahoo.com
Jean-Claude Pulfer		Consultant	jcpulfer@onlynet.com.py

Attachment 4: Actual Agenda

**OLADE / U. Calgary / ACDI Program
Vice Ministry of Mining and Energy
Rural Energy Project**

**MULTI-STAKEHOLDER WORKSHOP
Asunción, 19 - 20 December 2005**

Date/time	Activity	Person responsible
19/12/05		
3:30 p.m.	Opening and welcome for participants	Gustavo Cazal
3:35 p.m.	Governmental policies and actions in rural energy	Gustavo Cazal
3:50 p.m.	Presentation of OLADE's Rural Electrification Project	Byron Chilikuinga
4:50 p.m.	Refreshments	Hotel
5:20 p.m.	Brief participant introductions: name, institution, expectations	Jean-Claude Pulfer
5:30 p.m.	Presentation on the Assessment of the Energy Sector in Paraguay	Jean-Claude Pulfer
6:10 p.m.	Clarifying questions and discussion	Jean-Claude Pulfer
6:50 p.m.	End of first day, conclusions from the session	Gustavo Cazal

20/12/05		Person responsible
8:30 a.m.	Opening session	Gustavo Cazal
8:35 a.m.	Explanation of methodology for group work	Jean-Claude Pulfer
8:50 a.m.	Including social criteria in rural energy projects	Byron Chilikuinga
9:20 a.m.	Group work: Including different types of criteria in rural energy project design from social and governmental stakeholders' viewpoints	Rubén Ayala
10:30 a.m.	Refreshments	Hotel
10:45 a.m.	Continued Group work	Rubén Ayala
12:00 noon	Plenary: presentations of group conclusions	Rubén Ayala / Gilda Peralta
12:45 p.m.	Presentation of report on analysis and selection of communities in Paraguay	Jean-Claude Pulfer
1:30 p.m.	Lunch	Hotel

20/12/05		Person responsible
2:30 p.m.	Plenary: Discussion of methodology to select and approve the selected community	Jean-Claude Pulfer
3:30 p.m.	Proposal for sustainable development projects in indigenous communities of the Bajo Chaco	Modesto Elizeche
4:00 p.m.	Proposal for Multi-Stakeholder Workshop (TMA) for Rural Energy Projects in Paraguay	Jean-Claude Pulfer
4:15 p.m.	Plenary: Discussion of TMA proposal and commitments	Rubén Ayala
4:45 p.m.	Refreshments	Hotel
5:15 p.m.	Plenary: election of the steering commission	Rubén Ayala
6:00 p.m.	Presentation of workshop conclusions and evaluation in plenary	Jean-Claude Pulfer
6:30 p.m.	Close of the workshop	Gustavo Cazal

Attachment 5: Problems and solutions identified in the group work

Group 1: ethnic-cultural issues

PROBLEMS:

MARKETS

Indigenous people have products and crafts but no markets.

Imposed production systems go against cultural traits.

Contact with capitalism creates needs among indigenous people that are not grounded in reality.

LIVING CONDITIONS

Indigenous peoples' basic needs are unmet.

GENDER

Indigenous and rural women bear the heaviest burdens in household commitments.

No real, effective participation or representation of women in the development process.

LAND

Lack of legal or geographical land tenure.

SOLUTIONS:

MARKETS

Find markets for existing and potential production.

When implementing innovations in the indigenous community we must be aware of the impact they will have and analyze the pros and cons with them.

Seek markets, mainly for crafts.

LIVING CONDITIONS

Foster water supply and access as the basis for food security.

Create self-employment with solar energy.

GENDER

Incorporate women from the outset, especially in decision-making.

Identify sector groups and seek representation focused on real participation with a gender and generational approach

The project must involve different development agencies on an interdisciplinary basis.

LAND

Survey indigenous and rural communities and arrange their legal ownership quickly and efficiently.

Comply with the laws and Constitution

Group 1: educational issues

PROBLEMS:

LANGUAGE

In some regions school is not taught in the indigenous languages, because teachers are non-indigenous.

ILLITERACY

Illiteracy and lack of information make it difficult to overcome ethnic, cultural and gender problems.

ACCESS

Lack of equal opportunities (access) to formal education and vocational training

DIFFERENTIATED EDUCATION

There is no differentiated educational system meeting indigenous expectations, according to their cultural and environmental values

Education given by white people often leads students to lose their cultural identity.

SOLUTIONS:

LANGUAGE

Promote publication of multi-lingual materials to support formal education

Recover education in students' native language.

ILLITERACY

Implement studies to eradicate these problems.

ACCESS

Create equal opportunities to access formal education and vocational training

Differentiated programs for vocational training, respecting indigenous culture. Ongoing, inter-intergenerational education.

DIFFERENTIATED EDUCATION

Promote educational programs with a multi-cultural, environmental vision.

Group 2: economic issues

PROBLEMS:

PAYMENT CAPACITY

Capacity of the will to pay.

LACK OF MARKET AND TECHNOLOGY

Very poor technology. Needy population groups, especially rural, have incorporated very little alternative technology into their activities, e.g. direct planting, irrigation.

Lack of market: commodities are low-value and markets are uncertain.

ECONOMIC AND PRODUCTION-RELATED EDUCATION

Low productivity.

Little economic or health education.

PROPER SELECTION AND USE OF ENERGY SOURCES

Priority for lighting instead of irrigation and running water.

Macroeconomic issues affecting the country: > 70% use of biomass as an energy source.

SOLUTIONS:

PAYMENT CAPACITY

Productive use of energy, e.g. irrigation for self-supply and income generation

LACK OF MARKET AND TECHNOLOGY

Encourage crafts and tourism.

Define lines of production.

Incorporate technology into production.

Productivity by energy supply (electrification), water for home supply and irrigation.

ECONOMIC AND PRODUCTION-RELATED EDUCATION

Strengthen management capacity.

Training workshops with competent technicians for each area.

Implement an educational plan oriented toward economic and administrative activities.

PROPER SELECTION AND USE OF ENERGY SOURCES

Implement communication systems, e.g. Radio used for distance education.

Economic projects must be selected by communities.
Use: running water, irrigation, hot water, cooking foods.

Group 2: organizational and gender issues

PROBLEMS:**FORMAL EDUCATION**

Lack of education

Educate and train the community on the importance of the project.

Electrification requires training to be effective.

Training in electrification is required.

SOLUTIONS:**FORMAL EDUCATION**

Implement educational systems oriented toward organization, productivity and health.

PARTICIPATION

Equal participation by the community, including the female gender.

Lack of organizational capacity.

PARTICIPATION

Encourage community organization and women's participation.

Detect natural leaders in the community.

CONSCIOUSNESS-RAISING

Raise community awareness: they must feel like an active part of the project.

Little awareness to undertake payment commitments.

CONSCIOUSNESS-RAISING

The community must make the project its own.

Consciousness-raising to undertake responsibilities.

GENDER

In organizations, women have little or not participation.

Indigenous organizations do not include women, even to discuss economic problems, although women do housework.

GENDER

Incorporate women into productive activities.